

Design Review Board



Minutes

September 12, 2017
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Sean Banda - Chair
Randy Carter- Vice Chair
Tracy Roedel
Bryan Sandstrom
J. Seth Placko

Board Members Absent:

Taylor Candland (excused)
Nicole Thompson (excused)

Staff Present:

John Wesley
Lesley Davis
Kim Steadman
Wahid Alam
Veronica Gonzalez
Cassidy Welch
Mike Gildenstern

Others Present:

David Hughes
Nathan Palmer
Andrew Merchant
others

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

A. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:32 p.m.

A.1. DR17-013

The 1800 Block of East Baseline Road (north side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	Located west of Gilbert Road on the north side of Baseline Road
REQUEST:	This is a review of a pad building
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	3
OWNER:	David Schneider/ETAL
APPLICANT:	RKAA Architects
ARCHITECT:	Neil Feaser
STAFF PLANNER:	Lesley Davis

Tabled

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

A.2. DRB17-00055 The 7200 through 7400 blocks of East Ray Road (north side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located east of the northeast corner of Power and Ray Roads
REQUEST: This is a review of a retail/warehouse building
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: PHX-MESA Gateway Airport 193 LLC
APPLICANT: David Hughes
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam

Discussion: Staffmember Alam gave a brief update on the project. The applicant, David Hughes, presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Liked the agrarian feel of the architecture
- Liked the galvalume and brick interplay
- Confirmed that “Coroplast” corrugated plastic sheet material will be used in the white “window” areas
- Liked the pallette of materials used
- Suggested breaking up the vertical elements more, more undulation
- Confirmed that 3’-5’ reliefs were being incorporated to the elevation
- Liked the landscaping plan presented at the previous month’s meeting

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Liked the fenestration technique seen before, would like to see more of it
- Felt that the rendering was too dark and didn’t show the articulation very well

Boardmember Placko

- Appreciated how the applicant modified the 8’ wall from what was shown at the previous meeting
- Liked the employee area
- Liked how larger sweet acacia trees will be used to stay clear of pedestrian areas
- Confirmed with the applicant that primary entry monuments will be removed, and the planters will be placed around the property
- Liked previous design, but understands the maintenance issues with the initial design

Boardmember Carter

- Confirmed that the exterior façade will feature a more “tumbled-brick” surface
- Suggested using translucent panels on the exterior
- Felt that the building will present well, and the changes made will enhance building

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes September 12, 2017

Boardmember Carter

- Concerned that the main façade of the project facing the residential neighborhood to the south is the most severely flat façade
- Questioned why there was not more landscaping on the south side
- Confirmed that the fence is on a property line, and was curious as to why a larger tree was not selected to be placed along McLellan Rd.
- Proposed planting additional shrubbery, and additional trees on the outside of the southern fence
- Suggested using yellow lantana and/or agave on the south side
- Did not like the fence proposed on the south side
- Suggested more lush landscaping on the exterior of the southern fence, and placing trees behind the fence
- Concerned as to why the 6' fence extends out so far beyond the front line of the building
- Suggested wrapping the northeast landscaping around to the south side of the property
- Would like to see the perimeter wall pulled back, and more lush landscaping

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

A.4. DRB17-00157 1313 South Power Road

LOCATION/ADDRESS: South of the southeast corner of Southern Avenue and Power Road (east side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a retail PAD and restaurant with drive-thru
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: Winco Foods, LLC
APPLICANT: Merchant Design Group
ARCHITECT: Andrew Merchant
STAFF PLANNER: Veronica Gonzalez

Discussion: The architect, Andrew Merchant, presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Liked the idea of screening the SES box
- Proposed tying in the Del Taco drive-thru awning connection to the SES box, to make a canopy and to widen the landscape tract for more protection
- Confirmed with the applicant that the screen walls are currently existing, and they are ideally going to construct the building without disturbing them
- Suggested using edge of canopy signs, favoring length as it fills the space than height in this scenario

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Concerned about the placement of the SES, as someone may back into it
- Explained that Scottsdale requires artistic fences
- Liked the building
- Confirmed that the applicant will be using LED up-lighting and downlighting, at pilaster locations on the front and sides
- Also confirmed with the applicant that they will be installing can lights in canopies as shown on plan, to express the architecture
- Suggested painting the screen walls

Vice Chair Carter

- Confirmed with the applicant that the SES is placed where it is because space was limited with the 3-sided drive-thru
- Was concerned that a vehicle would strike the SES in it's current placement
- Suggested widening the landscape tract for an additional SES buffer
- Commented that the two walls shown closest to the building, on the north side, just south of the drive-thru, don't serve a purpose and that additional landscaping be added and maintained

Boardmember Roedel

- Mentioned that Chandler requires complete screening on all sides of SES boxes

Boardmember Placko

- Confirmed with the applicant that the landscape plan is currently coming together
- Cautioned against using mesquite in the planter islands as there is not enough soil mass to keep them in place. Proposed a smaller, more upright tree to handle wind

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

A.5. DRB17-00164

6447 East Southern Avenue

LOCATION/ADDRESS: West of the SWC of Power Road and Southern Avenue
REQUEST: This is the review of a new car rental facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: Western Alliance Bank
APPLICANT: Elisa Tostado
ARCHITECT: Dustin Chisum
STAFF PLANNER: Lesley Davis

Discussion: The architect, Dustin Chisum, presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Suggested that the applicant updates the design
- Suggested using the recently approved Jeep dealership on Superstition Springs Drive (Case DR16-036) as inspiration for the design. Specifically mentioning the weathered steel and other details that make the building pop out
- Warned against using 4K lighting, and suggested using 3K Kelvin or less, for a warmer light

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Stated that different accent materials were needed, maybe ground face CMU veneer, or metal paneling
- Didn't like the lighting proposed
- Liked the building volumes, but wanted more reveals and breaks in the stucco
- Suggested that the applicant update their model
- Liked the idea to use glass-type bay doors to match the front of the building
- Wanted to see better materiality, lighting, parapet proportions, and undulation

Boardmember Carter

- Felt that it looked like it was designed in the 1990's
- Felt the applicant had an opportunity to create something unique on the corner
- Felt that the east elevation, and the stone façade does not work
- Felt that the roof line is continuous, and that it should be broken, and that there is not enough differentiation between the lower and the upper parapet
- Suggested using different colors or materials on the bay doors, or glass type doors to match the front
- Felt that the western elevation that the composition of upper, median, and lower elements were strange and did not create a pleasing proportion
- Felt that the size of the cornice does not fit the height and volume of the building, and suggested enlarging it, and using a different profile
- Didn't like the stone and stucco used together, and suggested either using different material on either one, or multiple materials
- Suggested upgrading the low windows on the east elevation, as they will be very visible
- Proposed articulating the windows in a different manner
- Proposed trying a different front façade, to create more of an inviting space for customers into the office

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

- Also agreed that lighting could be improved, and suggested more up and down lighting
- Suggested more articulation to highlight the fenestration and materiality of walls

The Board requested that the project be back for review with the changes discussed.

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes September 12, 2017

B. Call to Order

Chair Banda called the meeting to order at 6:11 pm

C. Consider the Minutes from the August 8, 2017 meeting

On a motion by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Boardmember Sandstrom, the Board unanimously approved the August 8, 2017 minutes.

(Vote: 5-0)

D. Discuss and review the following Design Review cases for action at the September 12, 2017 Meeting:

D.1. DRB17-00160 4324 E Southern Avenue

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	West of the northwest corner of Southern Avenue and Greenfield Road (north side)
REQUEST:	This is a review of exposed exterior building illumination for a drive-thru restaurant pad
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	District 2
OWNER:	Classen Asset Management LLC
APPLICANT:	Archicon-Architecture and Interiors
STAFF PLANNER:	Wahid Alam

Discussion: Staff member Alam gave a brief description of the modified project to the Board. The applicants, Bill Joerling and Ken Treat, gave a presentation to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Proposed using a metal material for the underside of the canopy with recessed lights
- Felt that the design required more crispness/sharpness to compliment the mid-century style
- Liked the use of pea gravel or high-quality decomposed granite in the seating area, much like the gravel material used at the coffee shop at Agritopia in Gilbert
- Proposed using Grasscrete/pavers only around the perimeter of benches, with the rest of the seating area covered in decomposed granite
- Confirmed with applicant and staff that a 5' landscape buffer is required on perimeter
- Confirmed with Staff that there will not be a small screening wall on the drive-thru as it is adjacent to a retention basin and it does face a public street

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Underside of canopy stone, stucco, T5 fluorescent light, alternating in retro fashion
- Suggested using metal panels with recessed LED instead of the T5 fluorescent lighting solution proposed
- Suggested more updated material pattern
- Confirmed that down-lights are being used, and they are not necessarily recessed
- Confirmed that an off-white reflective material is being used under the ceiling overhang
- Suggested using longer LED strips (2', 4', 6') under the ceiling, and arranging them in

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes September 12, 2017

arrays of random patterns

- Open to the use of a smooth, flat, uniform surface on the underside of the canopy
- Proposed using a hybrid pattern of pavers and decomposed granite in the seating area with pavers only at the outside edges, and confirmed that the surface will be level for safety and aesthetic reasons
- Liked the building

Vice Chair Carter

- Liked the look of the recessed lighting in the ceiling
- Confirmed that ¼ minus decomposed granite, either roller-compacted or stabilized, will be used in the seating area

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested using a 48" box live oak in the planter
- Suggested using up-lighting first for the live oak, and then hanging lighting later, when the tree is larger
- Felt that the gravel choice in the seating area will be suitable as it will only be accessed by pedestrians, and not vehicle
- Felt that controlling access to the seating area will control the unwanted spread of gravel

It was moved by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Boardmember Sandstrom to recommend approval of case DRB17-00160 with Conditions:

1. Compliance with the development as described in the Design Review Board staff report and as shown on the site plan and exterior elevations submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of DRB17-00160 and companion Administrative Site Plan review.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Compliance with all requirements of the Development and Sustainability, Engineering, Transportation, and Solid Waste Departments.
5. Compliance with requirements of previously approved zoning case Z00-075 including Landscape Palette.
6. Install seating walls including 5' wide landscape yards along the drive thru lane in the patio area to the north side of the building.
7. Provide 5' wide landscape area between the pedestrian path and proposed trash enclosures.
8. Revise site plan to show the drive thru exit extended further west and connect to the driveway access from Southern Avenue just west of the property line as previously approved (Z00-75).
9. Provide an alternative paving material for crosswalks such as stamped or decorative concrete, pavers or similar finish (striping on asphalt is not acceptable).
10. If any component of the exposed neon lighting system becomes nonfunctional, neither the entire lighting system, nor any portion thereof, may be illuminated until the entire lighting system is repaired.
11. Signs (attached and detached monument signs including their size, area and location) needs separate approval process.
12. Install outdoor patio (north of the building) with ¼" minus roller compacted on stabilized decomposed granite.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

13. Install 48" box Live Oak tree in the center of the patio for shade.
14. The ceiling shall be hard trowel stucco finish, directly applied to the soffit with light fixtures (random length and pattern) flushed with finish.

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam

Recommendation : Approval with Conditions

VOTE: (4-0) approved (Boardmember Roedel was excused before the vote was taken)

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
September 12, 2017**

E. Other Business:

Planning Director Wesley discussed and received preliminary comments for a proposed 40-acre data center located north of the NEC of Elliot and Hawes Roads.

F. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644-3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644-2767.**